City of Detroit

CITY COUNCIL

IRVIN CORLEY, JR. FISCAL ANALYST (313) 224-1076 ANNE MARIE LANGAN ASSISTANT FISCAL ANALYST (313) 224-1078

FISCAL ANALYSIS DIVISION
Coleman A. Young Municipal Center
2 Woodward Avenue, Suite 218
Detroit, Michigan 48226
FAX: (313) 224-2783

E-Mail: cc-fiscal@ci.detroit.mi.us

TO:

COUNCIL MEMBERS

FROM:

Irvin Corley, Jr., Director

DATE:

April 24, 2007

RE:

Fiscal Impact of the Act 312 Arbitration Award for the Detroit Police

Officers Association (DPOA) Line Item 49 on Today's Calendar

Council requested that the Fiscal Analysis Division staff review the recent Act 312 Arbitration award for the DPOA for the financial impact on the city. I received and reviewed a copy of the Opinion and Award in the matter of the Act 312 Arbitration between the Detroit Police Officers Association and City of Detroit. This document provides a summary of the issues presented by each side, the rational for the arbitrator's decision, and the actual decision of the arbitration panel.

The cost analysis is shown for both the DPOA and the resultant cost or savings due to other labor agreements, specifically parity with the Detroit Fire Fighter's Association (DFFA). The majority of uniform employees of the City of Detroit are represented by one of the following four unions, Detroit Police Officers Association, Lieutenant's and Sergeant's Association (LSA), Detroit Police Command Officer's Association (representation status currently under review) (DPCOA), and the Detroit Fire Fighter's Association.

Due to the relationship between titles represented by these organization and past labor relation decisions and negotiations there are certain conditions that when awarded to one group may carry over or apply to others.

In summary for the costing estimates:

The DFFA has parity on all economic issues with the DPOA. Therefore any economic awards or decisions made with the DPOA will apply to the DFFA members at the aligned ranks.

The LSA has a "maintenance of differential" clause that requires rate adjustments for LSA members if an award to the DPOA would reduce the differential below certain levels between ranks. This applies only to the salary portion of the contract, not all economic issues. At the present time the pay increases negotiated or awarded to the LSA has expanded the differential enough that the

current Act 312 DPOA award will not require adjustment to LSA member rates until possibly the final year, 2008-09 of the DPOA award. The LSA is currently in the negotiation/arbitration process with the city.

Therefore, in addition to the direct costs of the Act 312 DPOA award on the members of that bargaining unit, some of the decision will be applied to member of other bargaining units. The following items that will apply to other bargaining units and have been estimated as to cost or savings in a similar fashion as for DPOA members:

All of the economic changes, salaries, pension, and benefits changes will be applied to approximately one half of the members of the DFFA, estimated @ 650 for costing purposes. The one half of the total members relates to associated ranks between the DPOA and DFFA.

No costs or savings will be estimated for LSA members as the maintenance of differential clause will not require rate adjustments due to the DPOA award. The benefit plan redesign and cost sharing will not apply to LSA until agreed upon by the bargaining unit and city, or it is awarded by an arbitration panel.

No costs or savings will be estimated for the DPCOA as there is not a "maintenance of differential" requirement, and their representation status is under review.

In the area of wages, the award granted the City's last best offer, but this grants wage increases to the DPOA over the same period of time that civilian unions and unrepresented employees have taken pay reductions, not an equitable situation.

I would judge the award as favorable to the City in the area of health care plan design and cost sharing. The award mirrors the plans accepted or imposed on civilian employees during the last contract negotiation period.

In my analysis the arbitration panel's decision to reduce the years of service required for DPOA members to qualify for retirement, from 25 to 20 years, is an item that will be very costly to the City and moves in the opposite direction from the rest of the world. The City did propose moving to a defined contribution pension plan, the direction the majority of employers are moving, but the arbitration panel rejected this concept. This item alone may add more than \$6 million per year just for the normal cost of pensions for the DPOA. To this amount I believe a large new unfunded accrued actuarial liability (UAAL) will be created and funded over the next 15 to 30 years. Council will remember during the financing of the existing UAAL discussions with Certificates of Participation (COP), one of the cautions put forth, was not to grant benefit increases that will create new UAAL until such time as the proposed Certificate of Participation are paid off.

The following table estimates the cost or savings of the award with a breakdown by individual items awarded. The estimates are based on 2006-07 budgeted numbers for most items. Salary increases are projected over the life of the agreement. Other items are shown at 2006-07 estimates, which are representative of the costs for each subsequent year.

Due to the timing of the award, I do not anticipate any savings from the decision on hospitalization/dental/eye care plan redesign and cost sharing. I do not believe this can be implemented retroactively and without holding an open enrollment period for the members to select benefits based on costs. The chart shows what the estimated cost or savings would be if the benefit plan re-design and cost sharing were applied all year on the second from last line. And the estimate without those savings included on the last line.

		DPOA	DFFA	TOTAL
Wages				
	2006-07	\$1,862,718	\$465,680	\$2,328,398
	2007-08	8,240,427	2,060,107	\$10,300,534
	2008-09	14,228,526	3,557,132	\$17,785,658
	Total	\$24,331,671	\$6,082,919	\$30,414,590
Excused Time-Good Friday		238,810	59,703	298,513
Excused Time-Easter		477,620		597,025
Legal Representation		100,000		100,000
Sick Leave		532,124		689,824
Shift Differential		210,745		295,450
Pension Provision		151,044		188,805
Hospitalization/Dental/Eye Care		(4,037,299)	(973,044)	(5,010,343)
2006-07 Cost, If all changes applied all year		(464,238)	(48,090)	(512,328)
2006-07 Cost, Assuming hospitalization and other cost savings not applicable to 06-07 due to implementation time				
required		\$3,573,061	\$924,954	\$4,498,015
2007-08 Cost, Assuming all changes applied all year		\$5,913,470	\$1,546,337	\$7,459,807

As can be seen, I estimate that the DPOA Act 312 Arbitration Award that applies to the DFFA as well because of parity will cost the General Fund budget for the current year 2006-07 as follows:

- Assuming hospitalization and other cost savings apply in 2006-07: \$(512,300) in net savings
- Assuming hospitalization and other cost savings do not apply in 2006-07:
 \$4.5 million

I estimate the total impact to the General Fund in 2007-08 as follows:

 Assuming hospitalization and other cost savings apply in 2007-08: \$7.46 million

For Council's edification, I have enclosed our detailed spreadsheets costing out the estimates with the assumptions used.

Attachments

cc: Council Divisions
Auditor General's Office
Roger Short, Chief Financial Officer
Pamela Scales, Budget Director
Kandia Milton, Mayor's Office

Sum-DPOA

illilliary o	f Act 312 DPOA Arbitration Award						
POA ISSU	Ec	For Colony On	lu.				
PUA 1550	EO	For Salary On		2008-09	Total		
	4 Manage Adiata 44	2006-07	2007-08	The state of the s	Total		
	1 Wages-Article 41	\$1,862,718	\$8,240,427	\$14,228,526	\$24,331,671		
	2 Pension Provision - Article 33	40 004 704		4.00/ 11	0 4 14 400/11	***	4.
	Pension Provision - Article 33	\$3,824,781	This include	es 1.9% Normal	Cost, and 1.18% U	AAL on a 30 Yea	r amortiza
	Reduce the current 25 years of service for retirement to 20 years		Will first be	required in 2007	7-08 if actuary stud	ly is re-done.	
	4 Pension Provision - Article 33						
	Retiree Annuities						111
	5 Pension - Article 33						
	6 Hospitalization - Article 21						
	7 Restricted Leave - Article 18						
	8 Excused Time - Article 32	\$238,810					
	Four Hours Good Friday						
	9 Excused Time - Article 32	\$477,620					
	Eight Hours Easter						
	10 Uniforms - Article 19						
	11 Legal Representation Indemnification - Article 28	\$100,000					
	Reimburse DPOA up to \$100,000 annually for officers criminally charged but not found guilty						
	12 Sick Leave - Article .35	\$532,124					
	Increase Sick Leave pay from current 60% to 70%	,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,					
	13 Bonus Vacation - Article 37					111	
	14 Emergency/Excused Leave Days - Article 25						
	15 Vacation Selection and Cancellation - Artilce 22						
	16 Shift Differential Article 30	\$210,745					
	Increase Current Afternoon Premium from \$.40 to \$.50 (25% increase), and Midnight from \$.50 to \$.60 (20% increase)	, , , , , ,				19	
	17 Educational Reimbursement - Article 20						
	Increase annual amounts for education						
	18 Overtime - Article 14			7			
	Up to eight hours overtime for medical treatment extending past officer's shift						
	19 Me Too - Article 48						
	20 Pension Provisions - Article 33	\$151,044					
	Members can purchase up to 3 years pension credit for miltary time.	\$151,044					
	21 Overtime - Article 14						
ity Issues	Members option to accept compensary time in lieu of pay for up to 480 hours.						
133003	22 Seniority - Article 10						
	Member with less than 3 years cannot submit transfer requests						
	23 Discipline - Article 9, G	1					

Sum-DPOA

Deals with probationary evaluation, extension of probation or dismissal		
24 Seniority (Homicide Exempt) - Article 10		
Add section as exempt for transfer request based on seniority		
25 Seniorty (Bomb Diposal Exempt) - Article 10		
Add section as exempt for transfer request based on seniority		
26 Miscellaneous (First Time Marijuana Use) - Article 40		
27 Miscellaneous (Canine) - Article 40		
Canine unit members must return dog and equiment under age of 5 years		
28 Pension - Actuarial Assumptions - Article 33		
Separate DPOA members costs in pension system, actuarial stydy		
29 Pension - Elimination of Escalator - Artilce 33		
30 Pension - Define Contribution - Article 33		
Require all future time of current and new hires to be credited to defined contribution plan		
31 Outside Employment - Article 14		
Require Liability Insurance for members working private security.		
32 Hospitalization, Medical Dental and Optical Care - Article 21(c)	(\$3,804,564) Hospitalization Only	
Cost Sharing of 20% (10% for BC/BS PPO)	(\$4,037,299) Hospitalization, Dental, Eye Care	

2 of 2

CKING	3 JULY 1, 2004 THRU JUNE 30, 2009			-											-
A ISSU	JES	AWARDED				Costing usin	ng \$47,762, 7/	1/06 After 5	years rate, 2,60	00 Members	(page 133 of av	vard states 2,300	to 2,900 officers		
											2006-07 Cost	2007-08 Cost	2008-09 Cost	Award Period C	ost
1	Wages-Article 41	City	Effective 7/1/04		0%										
			Effective 7/1/05		0%								,		
			Effective 7/1/06		0%										
			Effective 1/1/07		3%		\$47,762	2,600	\$124,181,200	1.50%	\$1,862,718	\$3,725,436	\$3,725,436	\$9,313,590	
			Effective 7/1/07		2%		\$49,194	2,600	\$127,904,400	2%		\$2,558,088	\$2,558,088	\$5,116,176	
			Effective 1/1/08		3%		\$50,177	2,600	\$130,460,200	1.50%		\$1,956,903	\$3,913,806	\$5,870,709	
			Effective 7/1/08		3%		\$51,682	2,600	\$134,373,200	3%			\$4,031,196	\$4,031,196	
											\$1,862,718	\$8,240,427	\$14,228,526	\$24,331,671	
															-
2	Pension Provision - Article 33	City	Status Quo - No I	ncreased Cost											
															F
3	Pension Provision - Article 33	Union	City Estimated \$1	0.000.000			Budget Police	Salarine	\$167,671,756		Normal Pension	24 90%	Normal Cost	1.90%	
3 1	Perision Provision - Article 33	Utilott	City Estimated 91	0,000,000			budget Folice	dalalies	\$107,071,750		Normal Ferision	24.0076	UAAL 14 Yrs	2.07%	_
													UAAL 30 Yrs	1.18%	
	Reduce the current 25 years												OAAL OU IIS	1.1076	
(of service for retirement to 20														
3	years		Union testified this	s was too high			DPOA Portion	n	\$124,181,200	74.06%		Normal Cost	\$2,359,442.80		
												UAAL 14 Yrs	\$2,570,550.84		
												UAAL 30 Yrs	\$1,465,338.16	\$3,824,780.96	
							m								
							Plus UAAL cr	eated, una	ble to determine	, would requ	uire actuary			?????	
	David David Adid 00														
	Pension Provision - Article 33	Union	Union and Trustee												
	Retiree Annuities		City contends that				ated, there will	be a cost,	out did not provi	de a estima	te.				
			Lacking better det	all, unable to dete	rmine potentia	I costs.									
-															
5 F	Pension - Article 33	City	Status Quo - No Ir	ncreased Cost											
6 H	Hospitalization - Article 21	City	Status Quo - No Ir	ncreased Cost											
7.0	Destricted Leave Artists 40	Oit	Otatus Our Na I												
/	Restricted Leave - Article 18	City	Status Quo - No Ir	ncreased Cost											
0 0	Excused Time - Article 32	Union	\$47,762												
	Four Hours Good Friday	Official	\$22.96		2,600	\$238,810									
·	San Trade Good Friday		Ψ22.00	-	2,000	ψεσσ,σ10									
9 F	Excused Time - Article 32	Union	\$47,762												
	Eight Hours Easter		\$22.96		2,600	\$477,620									
40 1	Iniforma Article 10	City	Status O	areas and Court											
10 (Uniforms - Article 19	City	Status Quo - No Ir	creased Cost											
11 1	Legal Representation ndemnification - Article 28	Union	No Estimate - Lac	k of Data on Num	per of Officers	charged and	I cleared over	any period	of time.						
	Reimburse DPOA up to														
	100,000 annually for officers														
	criminally charged but not		Arbitrators deter							. DPOA					
f	ound guilty		indicated that be	tween July 1998	and June 200	5, the DPO	A average has	been \$80,	000.						
										DPOA Port	ion				
12 5	Sick Leave - Article .35								Budget	74.06%	16.60%				
	ncrease Sick Leave pay from														
	current 60% to 70%		This is a 16.6% inc	crease in the bene	efit. Budget fo	r this item is			4,328,335	3,205,565	\$532,124				
	Bonus Vacation - Article 37			creased Cost											

								_						
	Emergency/Excused Leave													
14	Days - Article 25	Neither	Status Quo - No I	Increased Cost	-		-	1	-					
			1											
	Vacation Selection and	0.11	01.1											
15	Cancellation - Artilce 22	City	Status Quo - No I	ncreased Cost										
				2204	A			-					7	
				DPOA	Awarded Incr									-
16	Shift Differential Article 30	Union	Budget	74.06%	22.50%)		-		-				
	Increase Current Afternoon													
	Premium from \$.40 to \$.50													
	(25% increase), and Midnight													
	from \$.50 to \$.60 (20%		4 004 700	936,643	6040 745									
	increase)		1,264,709	930,043	\$210,745	1	-	+		-		-		
	Educational Reimbursement -					-	-	+		-				
17	Article 20	City	Status Quo - No II	percased Cost										
- 17	Increase annual amounts for	City	Status Quo - No II	licreased Cost				+	-	-				
	education													
	education					-		_						
18	Overtime - Article 14	City	Lack of data on nu	umbor of times	to this occurs	Neither par	ty astimated a	additional oc	ete					
10	Up to eight hours overtime for	Ony	Edun Of Udia Off III	aoor or unico, e	ino occurs	tomici pai	, commerced e		1					
	medical treatment extending													
	past officer's shift													
19	Me Too - Article 48	City	Status Quo - No Ir	ncreased Cost -	Depends on fu	ture awards.								
20	Pension Provisions - Article 33		Actuarial Study Cost											
	Members can purchase up to													
	3 years pension credit for													
	miltary time.		\$250,500		\$37,760.90									
			4,312		650	650								
				60.3%	15.1%									
							Police Unif-							
			Total	DPOA	DFFA	DPOA align	not DPOA							
	0 11 111111	011												
21	Overtime - Article 14	City	Status Quo - No Ir	ncrease/Decreas	e Cost					-				
	Members option to accept													
	compensary time in lieu of pay for up to 480 hours.												*	
	τοι up to 4ου nours.							-	-		-	_		-
ity Issues	e							-						
nty ISSUES	3							-					-	
22	Seniority - Article 10	Union	Staus Quo - No A	dditional Cost					-		-			
22	Member with less than 3 years	Official	Oldus Quo - NO Al	domonal oust										
	cannot submit transfer													
	requests													
23	Discipline - Article 9, G	Union	Staus Quo - No A	dditional Cost										
	Deals with probationary													
	evaluation, extension of													
	probation or dismissal													
	Seniority (Homicide Exempt) -													
24	Article 10	Union	Staus Quo - No Ad	dditional Cost										
	Add section as exempt for													
	transfer request based on													
	seniority													
	Seniorty (Bomb Diposal													
25	Exempt) - Article 10	Union	Staus Quo - No Ad	dditional Cost										
	Add section as exempt for													
	transfer request based on												7	
	seniority													
	Adiana Banana (Flant Time													
	Miscellaneous (First Time Marijuana Use) - Article 40	Union	Status Quo - No A	dditional Cost										

DPOA-Detail

	Escalator - Artilce 33 Pension - Define Contribution -		Union	Status Quo					10			
30	Article 33		Union	Status Quo - Lost	apportunity cost	s						
	Require all future time of current and new hires to be credited to defined contribution plan											
31			Union	Status Quo - No o	cost, continues e	xpose for City						
- 1	Require Liability Insurance for members working private security.											
	Hospitalization, Medical Dental and Optical Care - Article 21(c)		City	Budget	DPOA Portion	Savings						
	Cost Sharing of 20% (10% for BC/BS PPO)				74.06%					· ·		
	BO/BOTT O/		Hosp	27,037,568			DPOA currently shares or	nly .9%)				
		l.	Hosp, dental 8									

oummary of A	ct 312 DPOA Arbitration Award							
	*							-
POA ISSUES		For Salary Only						
		2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	Total			
	1 Wages-Article 41	\$465,680	\$2,060,107	\$3,557,132	\$6,082,918			
:	Pension Provision - Article 33							
	Pension Provision - Article 33	\$1,018,432	This includes	1.9% Normal	Cost, and 1.18% U/	AAL on a 30 Ye	ar amortizat	tion
	Reduce the current 25 years of service for retirement to 20 years				-08 if actuary stud			
4	Pension Provision - Article 33				_			
	Retiree Annuities							
	5 Pension - Article 33							
(6 Hospitalization - Article 21							
7	Restricted Leave - Article 18							
8	B Excused Time - Article 32	\$59,703						
	Four Hours Good Friday							
9	Excused Time - Article 32	\$119,405						
	Eight Hours Easter							
	Uniforms - Article 19							
11	Legal Representation Indemnification - Article 28	\$0						
	Reimburse DPOA up to \$100,000 annually for officers criminally charged but not							
	found guilty							
12	Sick Leave - Article .35	\$157,700						
	Increase Sick Leave pay from current 60% to 70%							-
13	Bonus Vacation - Article 37							
	Emergency/Excused Leave Days - Article 25							
	Vacation Selection and Cancellation - Artilce 22							
	Shift Differential Article 30	\$84,705						
	Increase Current Afternoon Premium from \$.40 to \$.50 (25% increase), and Midnight from \$.50 to \$.60 (20% increase)							
17	Educational Reimbursement - Article 20							T .
	Increase annual amounts for education							
18	Overtime - Article 14							
	Up to eight hours overtime for medical treatment extending past officer's shift							
19	Me Too - Article 48							17.
20	Pension Provisions - Article 33	\$37,761						
	Members can purchase up to 3 years pension credit for miltary time.							
21	Overtime - Article 14							
	Members option to accept compensary time in lieu of pay for up to 480 hours.							
ty Issues								
22	Seniority - Article 10							
	Member with less than 3 years cannot submit transfer requests							
23	Discipline - Article 9, G							
	Deals with probationary evaluation, extension of probation or dismissal							
24	Seniority (Homicide Exempt) - Article 10							
	Add section as exempt for transfer request based on seniority							
25	Seniorty (Bomb Diposal Exempt) - Article 10							
	Add section as exempt for transfer request based on seniority							

Sum-DFFA

26 Miscellaneous	(First Time Marijuana Use) - Article 40						
27 Miscellaneous	(Canine) - Article 40						
Canine unit m	embers must return dog and equiment under age of 5 years						
28 Pension - Act	arial Assumptions - Article 33						
Separate DP0	A members costs in pension system, actuarial stydy						,
29 Pension - Elin	ination of Escalator - Artilce 33						
30 Pension - Def	ne Contribution - Article 33						,
Require all fur contribution p	ure time of current and new hires to be credited to defined an						
31 Outside Empl	yment - Article 14						
Require Liabil	ly Insurance for members working private security.						
32 Hospitalizatio	, Medical Dental and Optical Care - Article 21(c)	(\$912,529)	Hospitalizatio	n Only			
Cost Sharing	of 20% (10% for BC/BS PPO)	(\$973,044)	Hospitalizatio	n, Dental, Ey	e Care		

4/24/2007

CT 312 DPOA ARBITRATION AWARD MADE MARC OVERING JULY 1, 2004 THRU JUNE 30, 2009			Ī											
77211110 0021 1, 2007 11110 00112 00, 2000														
POA ISSUES	AWARDED				Costing using	\$47,762,7/1/0	6 After 5 ye	ears rate, 650 M	embers (es		FFA members in			
										2006-07 Cost	2007-08 Cost	2008-09 Cost	Award Period C	ost
1 Wages-Article 41	City	Effective 7/1/04		0%										
		Effective 7/1/05		0%										
		Effective 7/1/06		0%		0.43 300	050	001015000	1 8001	0.105.000		*****		
		Effective 1/1/07	-	3%		\$47,762		\$31,045,300	1.50%	\$465,680	\$931,359	\$931,359	\$2,328,398	-
		Effective 7/1/07		2%		\$49,194	650		2%		\$639,522	\$639,522	\$1,279,044	
		Effective 1/1/08	-	3%		\$50,177	650		1.50%		\$489,226	\$978,452	\$1,467,677	-
		Effective 7/1/08		3%	1	\$51,682	650	\$33,593,300	3%	# 40F 000	\$0.000.40Z	\$1,007,799	\$1,007,799	-
										\$465,680	\$2,060,107	\$3,557,132	\$6,082,918	
2 Pension Provision - Article 33	City	Status Quo - No	Increased Co	st										
3 Pension Provision - Article 33	Union	City Entimeted 6	10 000 000			Budget Fire C	alarias	\$66,131,923		Normal Dansies	24 000	Normal Cast	1.90%	
5 Perision Provision - Article 33	Union	City Estimated \$	10,000,000			Budget Fire S	aianes	\$00,131,923		Normal Pension	24.80%	Normal Cost UAAL 14 Yrs	1.90% 2.07%	
												UAAL 14 Yrs UAAL 30 Yrs	1.18%	
Reduce the current 25 years			1									UNAL 30 118	1.10%	
of service for retirement to 20														
years		Union testified th	is was too hig	h		DFFA-DPOA	Alighed	\$33,065,962	50.00%		Normal Cost	\$628,253.28		
											UAAL 14 Yrs	\$684,465.41	\$1,312,718.69	
											UAAL 30 Yrs	\$390,178.35	\$1,018,431.63	
												*		
						Plus UAAL cre	eated, unab	le to determine,	would requ	ire actuary			?????	
											- 21			
4 Pension Provision - Article 33	Union	Union and Truste	ses contend n	n City Cost										
Retiree Annuities	Omon	City contends that			urns are not allo	ncated there w	ill he a cost	but did not pro	wide a estin	nate				
Trouted Farmanage		Lacking better de				bootoo, tricio vi	III DC & COST	, but ala not pre	vide a coun	into.				
5 Pension - Article 33	City	Status Quo - No	Increased Co	st										
6 Hospitalization - Article 21	City	Status Quo - No	Increased Co	st		1								
7 Restricted Leave - Article 18	011	0.1.0.1												
/ Restricted Leave - Article 18	City	Status Quo - No	Increased Co	St										
8 Excused Time - Article 32	Union	\$47,762	-											
Four Hours Good Friday	Official	\$22.96		650	\$59,703									
		\$EE.00	-	300	400,700									
9 Excused Time - Article 32	Union	\$47,762												
Eight Hours Easter		\$22.96	8	650	\$119,405									
10 Uniforms - Article 19	City	Status Quo - No	Increased Co	st										
118											1			
Legal Representation 11 Indemnification - Article 28	Heine	No Folimete	al of Data	Number of Off	Eases share	and alastad		d of time						
Reimburse DPOA up to	Union	No Estimate - La	ck of Data on	Number of Off	ncers charged a	ing cleared ove	r any peno	d or time.						
\$100,000 annually for officers														
criminally charged but not		Arbitrators deter	rmined the \$1	100 000 is for	all officers for	the year there	fore \$100 (000 annual cos	t DPOA					
found guilty		indicated that be												
30007		The second state of	- Controlly			arenego no		,						
									DFFA-DPC	A aligned portion	n			
12 Sick Leave - Article .35								Budget	50.00%	16.60%				
Increase Sick Leave pay from		V 0.770/03/00/01 As accessors												
current 60% to 70%		This is a 16.6% in	ncrease in the	benefit. Budg	et for this item	is		1,900,000	950,000	\$157,700				
13 Bonus Vacation - Article 37	City	Status Quo - No												

	Emana de la companya					-					_			
14	Emergency/Excused Leave Days - Article 25	Neither	Status Quo - No	Increased Co	st									
45	Vacation Selection and	0.11	01-1 0 11-				1							
15	Cancellation - Artilce 22	City	Status Quo - No	Increased Co	ist									
				DFFA	Awarded Inc	A	-							
40	Shift Differential Article 30	Union	Dudeet				-				-	-		
10	Increase Current Afternoon	Union	Budget	50.00%	22.50%		-				-	_		_
	Premium from \$.40 to \$.50													
	(25% increase), and Midnight													
	from \$.50 to \$.60 (20%													
	increase)		752,935	376,468	\$84,705									
	more de la company		, 02,000	0.0,100	432,100									
	Educational Reimbursement -													
17	Article 20	City	Status Quo - No	Increased Co	st									
	Increase annual amounts for													
	education					-								
18	3 Overtime - Article 14	City	Lack of data on r	umber of tim	es, etc. this oc	curs. Neither p	party estimated	additional cost	S.					
	Up to eight hours overtime for													
	medical treatment extending													
	past officer's shift						-						-	
40	Me Too - Article 48	City	Status Quo - No	nerpaced Co	et - Donanda	on future owerd	e							
19	ME 100 - Article 40	City	Status Quo - No	increased C0	si - Depends (in ruture award	io.							
						-						-		
20	Pension Provisions - Article 33		Actuarial Study Cost											
	Members can purchase up to		riotauna otaay ooat							- 1				
	3 years pension credit for													
	miltary time.		\$250,500	151,043.60	\$37,760.90	\$37,760.90	\$23,934.60							
			4,312	2,600	650	650	412							
	_			60.3%	15.1%									
						DFFA-not	Police Unif-							
			Total	DPOA	DFFA	DPOA align	not DPOA							
		-												
21	Overtime - Article 14	City	Status Quo - No	ncrease/Dec	rease Cost									
	Members option to accept compensary time in lieu of pay													
	for up to 480 hours.													
City Issues														4
City issues	5											-	-	
22	Seniority - Article 10	Union	Staus Quo - No A	dditional Cos	1									
	Member with less than 3 years	Official	Staus Quo - 140 /	dullional Cos										
	cannot submit transfer													
	cannot submit transfer requests													
	requests													
23	requests Discipline - Article 9, G	Union	Staus Quo - No A	dditional Cos	t									
23	Discipline - Article 9, G Deals with probationary	Union	Staus Quo - No A	dditional Cos	t									
23	requests Discipline - Article 9, G Deals with probationary evaluation, extension of	Union	Staus Quo - No A	dditional Cos	t									
23	Discipline - Article 9, G Deals with probationary	Union	Staus Quo - No A	dditional Cos	t									
23	requests Discipline - Article 9, G Deals with probationary evaluation, extension of probation or dismissal	Union	Staus Quo - No A	dditional Cos	t									
23	requests Discipline - Article 9, G Deals with probationary evaluation, extension of probation or dismissal Seniority (Homicide Exempt) -													
23	requests Discipline - Article 9, G Deals with probationary evaluation, extension of probation or dismissal Seniority (Homicide Exempt) - Article 10	Union	Staus Quo - No A											
23	requests Discipline - Article 9, G Deals with probationary evaluation, extension of probation or dismissal Seniority (Homicide Exempt) - Article 10 Add section as exempt for													
23	requests Discipline - Article 9, G Deals with probationary evaluation, extension of probation or dismissal Seniority (Homicide Exempt) - Article 10 Add section as exempt for transfer request based on													
23	requests Discipline - Article 9, G Deals with probationary evaluation, extension of probation or dismissal Seniority (Homicide Exempt) - Article 10 Add section as exempt for													
23	requests Discipline - Article 9, G Deals with probationary evaluation, extension of probation or dismissal Seniority (Homicide Exempt) - Article 10 Add section as exempt for transfer request based on													
23	requests Discipline - Article 9, G Deals with probationary evaluation, extension of probation or dismissal Seniority (Homicide Exempt) - Article 10 Add section as exempt for transfer request based on seniority			dditional Cos	t									
24	requests Discipline - Article 9, G Deals with probationary evaluation, extension of probation or dismissal Seniority (Homicide Exempt) - Article 10 Add section as exempt for transfer request based on seniority Seniorty (Bomb Diposal Exempt) - Article 10	Union	Staus Quo - No A	dditional Cos	t									
23	requests Discipline - Article 9, G Deals with probationary evaluation, extension of probation or dismissal Seniority (Homicide Exempt) - Article 10 Add section as exempt for transfer request based on seniority Seniorty (Bomb Diposal Exempt) - Article 10 Add section as exempt for	Union	Staus Quo - No A	dditional Cos	t									
24	requests Discipline - Article 9, G Deals with probationary evaluation, extension of probation or dismissal Seniority (Homicide Exempt) - Article 10 Add section as exempt for transfer request based on seniority Seniorty (Bomb Diposal Exempt) - Article 10 Add section as exempt for transfer request based on	Union	Staus Quo - No A	dditional Cos	t									
24 25	requests Discipline - Article 9, G Deals with probationary evaluation, extension of probation or dismissal Seniority (Homicide Exempt) - Article 10 Add section as exempt for transfer request based on seniority Seniorty (Bomb Diposal Exempt) - Article 10 Add section as exempt for transfer request based on seniority	Union	Staus Quo - No A	dditional Cos	t									
24	requests Discipline - Article 9, G Deals with probationary evaluation, extension of probation or dismissal Seniority (Homicide Exempt) - Article 10 Add section as exempt for transfer request based on seniority Seniorty (Bomb Diposal Exempt) - Article 10 Add section as exempt for transfer request based on	Union	Staus Quo - No A	dditional Cos	t									

DFFA-Detail

Miscellaneous (Canine) - 27 Article 40	Split		While savings or	cost were ar	gued, cannot d	etermine at this	time						
Canine unit members must return dog and equiment under age of 5 years													
andor ago ar a yours													
Pension - Actuarial 28 Assumptions - Article 33	Union		Status Quo										1
Separate DPOA members costs in pension system, actuarial stydy													
Pension - Elimination of									+		-		-
29 Escalator - Artilce 33	Union		Status Quo										
Pension - Define Contribution - 30 Article 33	Union		Status Quo - Los	t apportunity	costs								
Require all future time of current and new hires to be credited to defined contribution plan	5									-			
Outside Employment - Article		-										-	
31 14	Union		Status Quo - No	cost, continue	s expose for C	ity							
Require Liability Insurance for members working private security.					•				1 1 1 1				
Hospitalization, Medical Dental and Optical Care - Article 32 21(c)	City		Budget	DFFA Portion	Savings								
Cost Sharing of 20% (10% for BC/BS PPO)				50.00%	19%								
		Hosp	9,605,568	4,802,784	(\$912,529)	DPOA currentl	y shares only	.9%)					
		Hosp, dental &											
	one same to the same	Optical	10,242,568	5,121,284	(\$973,044)								